



**Legislative Assembly  
Province of Alberta**

No. 23

## **VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

First Session

Twenty-Ninth Legislature

---

Wednesday, November 25, 2015

The Speaker took the Chair at 9:00 a.m.

### **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

Hon. Mr. Mason, Government House Leader, advised the Assembly that Ministerial Statements will not be called as the first item of business this morning in accordance with the unanimous consent granted on November 24, 2015, but will instead be called at its normal time during the Daily Routine.

### **Adjournment**

On motion by Hon. Mr. Mason, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 9:03 a.m. until 1:30 p.m.

WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2015 — 1:30 PM

### **ROUTINE**

The Speaker offered a prayer and a moment of silence was observed in recognition of the death of former Member Mrs. Weslyn Melva Mather, Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods, 2004 to 2008, who passed away on November 22, 2015.

Hon. Mr. Wanner, Speaker of the Legislative Assembly, requested and received the unanimous consent of the Assembly to waive Standing Order 7(1.1) in order to complete Ministerial Statements.

### **Ministerial Statements**

Hon. Ms Notley, Premier, made a statement recognizing the life and distinguished career of Mr. Bhullar, Hon. Member for Calgary-Greenway, who was tragically killed on November 23, 2015.

Mr. Jean, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, commented on the statement.

Hon. Mr. Mason, Government House Leader, requested and received the unanimous consent of the Assembly to allow the Leader of the Progressive Conservative Opposition, the Member for Calgary-Mountain View, and the Member for Calgary-Elbow to comment on the Ministerial Statement, and that the three-minute response time be waived for Mr. McIver, Hon. Leader of the Progressive Conservative Opposition.

Mr. McIver, Hon. Leader of the Progressive Conservative Opposition, Dr. Swann, Hon. Member for Calgary-Mountain View, and Mr. Clark, Hon. Member for Calgary-Elbow, then commented on the statement.

Hon. Mr. Mason, Government House Leader, requested and received the unanimous consent of the Assembly to waive Standing Order 7(7) in order to complete the Daily Routine.

### **Members' Statements**

Hon. Mr. Mason, Government House Leader, requested and received the unanimous consent of the Assembly to waive Standing Order 7(4) to allow the Hon. Member for Calgary-McCall to participate in today's Members' Statements.

Mr. Panda, Hon. Member for Calgary-Foothills, made a statement paying tribute to Mr. Bhullar, Hon. Member for Calgary-Greenway, who passed away on November 23, 2015.

Ms Babcock, Hon. Member for Stony Plain, made a statement recognizing November 28, 2015, as Holodomor Memorial Day.

Mr. Ellis, Hon. Member for Calgary-West, made a statement paying tribute to Mr. Bhullar, Hon. Member for Calgary-Greenway, who passed away on November 23, 2015.

Ms McPherson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Mackay-Nose Hill, made a statement recognizing November 25, 2015, as the International Day for the Elimination of Violence Against Women.

Mr. Sabir, Hon. Member for Calgary-McCall (Minister of Human Services), made a statement paying tribute to Mr. Bhullar, Hon. Member for Calgary-Greenway, who passed away on November 23, 2015.

Mrs. Littlewood, Hon. Member for Fort Saskatchewan-Vegreville, made a statement regarding the work of the Families First Society in Fort Saskatchewan.

### **Tabling Returns and Reports**

Hon. Mr. Ceci, President of Treasury Board and Minister of Finance, on behalf of Hon. Ms Hoffman, Minister of Health and Minister of Seniors:

Responses to questions raised by Mr. Yao, Hon. Member for Fort McMurray-Wood Buffalo, and MLA Cortes-Vargas, Hon. Member for Strathcona-Sherwood Park, on November 18, 2015, Ministry of Seniors, 2015-16 Main Estimates debate  
Sessional Paper 148/2015

Hon. Mr. Mason, Minister of Infrastructure and Minister of Transportation, on behalf of Hon. Ms Sigurdson, Minister of Advanced Education and Minister of Jobs, Skills, Training and Labour:

Responses to questions raised by Mr. Hunter, Hon. Member for Cardston-Taber-Warner, Mr. McIver, Hon. Leader of the Progressive Conservative Opposition, and Dr. Swann, Hon. Member for Calgary-Mountain View, on November 3, 2015, Ministry of Jobs, Skills, Training and Labour, 2015-16 Main Estimates debate  
Sessional Paper 149/2015

Hon. Mr. Mason, Minister of Infrastructure and Minister of Transportation:

Responses to questions raised by Mr. van Dijken, Hon. Member for Barrhead-Morinville-Westlock, Mr. McIver, Hon. Leader of the Progressive Conservative Opposition, and Mrs. Aheer, Hon. Member for Chestermere-Rocky View, on November 2, 2015, Ministry of Transportation, 2015-16 Main Estimates debate  
Sessional Paper 150/2015

Responses to questions raised by Mr. Schneider, Hon. Member for Little Bow, and Mr. Bhullar, Hon. Member for Calgary-Greenway, on November 4, 2015, Ministry of Infrastructure, 2015-16 Main Estimates debate  
Sessional Paper 151/2015

## **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

### **Committee of Supply** (Main Estimates)

According to Order, the Assembly resolved itself into Committee of Supply and the Speaker left the Chair.

(Assembly in Committee)

MLA Miranda, Chair, Standing Committee on Alberta's Economic Future, presented the following report:

Pursuant to Standing Order 59.01(10), the Standing Committee on Alberta's Economic Future has reviewed the 2015-2016 proposed estimates and business plans for the Ministries of Executive Council, Advanced Education, Agriculture and Forestry, Economic Development and Trade, Infrastructure, and Jobs, Skills, Training and Labour.

MLA Miranda then presented proposed amendments to the 2015-2016 estimates for the Ministries of Agriculture and Forestry and Infrastructure.

Ms Sweet, Chair, Standing Committee on Families and Communities, presented the following report:

Pursuant to Standing Order 59.01(10), the Standing Committee on Families and Communities has reviewed the 2015-16 proposed estimates and business plans for the Ministries of Culture and Tourism, Education, Health, Human Services, Justice and Solicitor General, Seniors, Service Alberta, and Status of Women.

Ms Sweet then presented proposed amendments to the 2015-16 estimates for the Ministries of Education and Service Alberta.

Ms Goehring, Chair, Standing Committee on Resource Stewardship, presented the following report:

Pursuant to Standing Order 59.01(10), the Standing Committee on Resource Stewardship has reviewed the 2015-16 proposed estimates and business plans for the Ministries of Aboriginal Relations, Energy, Environment and Parks, Municipal Affairs, Transportation, and Treasury Board and Finance.

Ms Goehring then presented proposed amendments to the 2015-2016 estimates for the Ministries of Transportation and Treasury Board and Finance.

Pursuant to Standing Order 59.03(1)(a), the following amendments were voted on:

The question being put on Amendment A1, proposed by Mr. Hanson, Hon. Member for Lac La Biche-St. Paul-Two Hills, that the 2015-16 Main Estimates of the Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry be reduced for the Minister's Office under reference 1.1 at page 40 by \$50,000 so that the amount to be voted at page 39 for Expense is \$1,128,139,000, the amendment was defeated. With Ms Jabbour at the Table, the names being called for were taken as follows:

For the amendment: 19

Aheer	Hanson	Smith
Anderson (Highwood)	Hunter	Stier
Clark	Loewen	Strankman
Cooper	MacIntyre	Taylor
Cyr	Panda	van Dijken
Fildebrandt	Schneider	Yao
Gotfried		

Against the amendment: 43

Anderson (Leduc-Beaumont)	Gray	Nielsen
Bilous	Hinkley	Payne
Carson	Horne	Phillips
Ceci	Kazim	Piquette
Connolly	Kleinstauber	Renaud
Coolahan	Littlewood	Rosendahl
Cortes-Vargas	Loyola	Schmidt
Dach	Luff	Shepherd
Dang	Malkinson	Starke
Drever	Mason	Sucha
Eggen	McKitrick	Sweet
Feehan	McLean	Turner
Fitzpatrick	McPherson	Westhead
Ganley	Miranda	Woollard
Goehring		

The question being put on Amendment A2, proposed by Mr. Smith, Hon. Member for Drayton Valley-Devon, that the 2015-16 Main Estimates of the Ministry of Education be reduced for the Minister's Office under reference 1.1 at page 88 by \$141,000 so that the amount to be voted at page 87 for Expense is \$4,314,684,000, the amendment was defeated. With Ms Jabbour at the Table, the names being called for were taken as follows:

For the amendment: 20

Aheer	Hanson	Starke
Anderson (Highwood)	Hunter	Stier
Clark	Loewen	Strankman
Cooper	MacIntyre	Taylor
Cyr	Panda	van Dijken
Fildebrandt	Schneider	Yao
Gotfried	Smith	

Against the amendment: 41

Anderson (Leduc-Beaumont)	Goehring	Miranda
Bilous	Gray	Nielsen
Carson	Hinkley	Payne
Ceci	Horne	Piquette
Connolly	Kazim	Renaud
Coolahan	Kleinstauber	Rosendahl
Cortes-Vargas	Littlewood	Schmidt
Dach	Loyola	Shepherd
Dang	Luff	Sucha
Drever	Malkinson	Sweet
Eggen	Mason	Turner
Feehan	McKitrick	Westhead
Fitzpatrick	McLean	Woollard
Ganley	McPherson	

The question being put on Amendment A3, proposed by Mr. Hunter, Hon. Member for Cardston-Taber-Warner, that the 2015-16 Main Estimates of the Ministry of Infrastructure be reduced for the Minister's Office under reference 1.1 at page 162 by \$185,000 so that the amount to be voted at page 161 for Expense is \$546,446,000, the amendment was defeated. With Ms Jabbour at the Table, the names being called for were taken as follows:

For the amendment: 19

Aheer	Hanson	Smith
Anderson (Highwood)	Hunter	Starke
Clark	Loewen	Stier
Cooper	MacIntyre	Taylor
Cyr	Panda	van Dijken
Fildebrandt	Schneider	Yao
Gotfried		

Against the amendment: 40

Anderson (Leduc-Beaumont)	Gray	Miranda
Bilous	Hinkley	Nielsen
Carson	Horne	Payne
Ceci	Kazim	Piquette
Connolly	Kleinstauber	Renaud
Coolahan	Littlewood	Rosendahl
Cortes-Vargas	Loyola	Schmidt
Dach	Luff	Shepherd
Dang	Malkinson	Sucha
Drever	Mason	Sweet
Feehan	McKitrick	Turner
Fitzpatrick	McLean	Westhead
Ganley	McPherson	Woollard
Goehring		

The question being put on Amendment A4, proposed by Mr. Anderson, Hon. Member for Highwood, that the 2015-16 Main Estimates of the Ministry of Service Alberta be reduced for the Minister's Office under reference 1.1 at page 218 by \$164,000 so that the amount to be voted at page 217 for Expense is \$315,582,000, the amendment was defeated. With Ms Jabbour at the Table, the names being called for were taken as follows:

For the amendment: 20

Aheer	Gotfried	Smith
Anderson (Highwood)	Hanson	Starke
Clark	Hunter	Stier
Cooper	Loewen	Taylor
Cyr	MacIntyre	van Dijken
Fildebrandt	Panda	Yao
Fraser	Schneider	

Against the amendment: 40

Anderson (Leduc-Beaumont)	Gray	Miranda
Bilous	Hinkley	Nielsen
Carson	Horne	Payne
Ceci	Kazim	Piquette
Connolly	Kleinsteuber	Renaud
Coolahan	Littlewood	Rosendahl
Cortes-Vargas	Loyola	Schmidt
Dach	Luff	Shepherd
Dang	Malkinson	Sucha
Drever	Mason	Sweet
Feehan	McKitrick	Turner
Fitzpatrick	McLean	Westhead
Ganley	McPherson	Woollard
Goehring		

The question being put on Amendment A5, proposed by Mrs. Aheer, Hon. Member for Chestermere-Rocky View, that the 2015-16 Main Estimates of the Ministry of Transportation be reduced for the Minister's Office under reference 1.1 at page 234 by \$72,000 so that the amount to be voted at page 233 for Expense is \$850,463,000, the amendment was defeated. With Ms Jabbour at the Table, the names being called for were taken as follows:

For the amendment: 22

Aheer	Hanson	Smith
Anderson (Highwood)	Hunter	Starke
Clark	Loewen	Stier
Cooper	MacIntyre	Swann
Cyr	McIver	Taylor
Fildebrandt	Panda	van Dijken
Fraser	Schneider	Yao
Gotfried		

Against the amendment: 39

Anderson (Leduc-Beaumont)	Gray	Miranda
Bilous	Hinkley	Nielsen
Carson	Horne	Payne
Ceci	Kazim	Piquette
Connolly	Kleinsteuber	Renaud
Coolahan	Littlewood	Rosendahl
Cortes-Vargas	Loyola	Schmidt
Dach	Luff	Shepherd
Dang	Malkinson	Sucha
Drever	Mason	Sweet
Feehan	McKitrick	Turner
Fitzpatrick	McLean	Westhead
Goehring	McPherson	Woollard

The question being put on Amendment A6, proposed by Mr. Stier, Hon. Member for Livingstone-Macleod, that the 2015-16 Main Estimates of the Ministry of Treasury Board and Finance be reduced for the Minister's Office under reference 1.1 at page 248 by \$386,000 so that the amount to be voted at page 247 for Expense is \$150,430,000, the amendment was defeated. With Ms Jabbour at the Table, the names being called for were taken as follows:

For the amendment: 22

Aheer	Hanson	Smith
Anderson (Highwood)	Hunter	Starke
Clark	Loewen	Stier
Cooper	MacIntyre	Swann
Cyr	McIver	Taylor
Fildebrandt	Panda	van Dijken
Fraser	Schneider	Yao
Gotfried		



Against the amendment: 39

Anderson (Leduc-Beaumont)	Gray	Miranda
Bilous	Hinkley	Nielsen
Carson	Horne	Payne
Ceci	Kazim	Piquette
Connolly	Kleinsteuber	Renaud
Coolahan	Littlewood	Rosendahl
Cortes-Vargas	Loyola	Schmidt
Dach	Luff	Shepherd
Dang	Malkinson	Sucha
Drever	Mason	Sweet
Feehan	McKitrick	Turner
Fitzpatrick	McLean	Westhead
Goehring	McPherson	Woollard

Amendment to the Main Estimates for the Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry (A1) (Hon. Member for Lac La Biche-St. Paul-Two Hills) — Defeated on division  
Sessional Paper 152/2015

Amendment to the Main Estimates for the Ministry of Education (A2) (Hon. Member for Drayton Valley-Devon) — Defeated on division  
Sessional Paper 153/2015

Amendment to the Main Estimates for the Ministry of Infrastructure (A3) (Hon. Member for Cardston-Taber-Warner) — Defeated on division  
Sessional Paper 154/2015

Amendment to the Main Estimates for the Ministry of Service Alberta (A4) (Hon. Member for Highwood) — Defeated on division  
Sessional Paper 155/2015

Amendment to the Main Estimates for the Ministry of Transportation (A5) (Hon. Member for Chestermere-Rocky View) — Defeated on division  
Sessional Paper 156/2015

Amendment to the Main Estimates for the Ministry of Treasury Board and Finance (A6) (Hon. Member for Livingstone-Macleod) — Defeated on division  
Sessional Paper 157/2015

The question being put on all matters relating to the Main Estimates for the General Revenue Fund and Lottery Fund for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2016, the motion was agreed to. With Ms Jabbour in the Chair, the names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 39

Anderson (Leduc-Beaumont)	Gray	Miranda
Bilous	Hinkley	Nielsen
Carson	Horne	Payne
Ceci	Kazim	Piquette
Connolly	Kleinstauber	Renaud
Coolahan	Littlewood	Rosendahl
Cortes-Vargas	Loyola	Schmidt
Dach	Luff	Shepherd
Dang	Malkinson	Sucha
Drever	Mason	Sweet
Feehan	McKitrick	Turner
Fitzpatrick	McLean	Westhead
Goehring	McPherson	Woollard

Against the motion: 22

Aheer	Hunter	Smith
Anderson (Highwood)	Loewen	Starke
Cooper	MacIntyre	Stier
Cyr	McIver	Swann
Fildebrandt	Panda	Taylor
Fraser	Rodney	van Dijken
Gotfried	Schneider	Yao
Hanson		

And after some time spent therein, the Deputy Speaker assumed the Chair and Mr. Malkinson reported as follows:

Mr. Speaker:

The Committee of Supply has had under consideration certain resolutions of the 2015-16 Offices of the Legislative Assembly, Government Estimates and Lottery Fund, reports as follows, and requests leave to sit again:

Resolved that a sum not exceeding the following be granted to Her Majesty for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2016, for the Departments and purposes indicated:

<b>Support to the Legislative Assembly</b>	\$68,199,000
<b>Office of the Auditor General</b>	\$26,754,000
<b>Office of the Ombudsman</b>	\$3,282,000
<b>Office of the Chief Electoral Officer</b>	\$31,685,000
<b>Office of the Ethics Commissioner</b>	\$1,153,000

<b>Office of the Information and Privacy Commissioner</b>	\$6,843,000
<b>Office of the Child and Youth Advocate</b>	\$13,242,000
<b>Office of the Public Interest Commissioner</b>	\$1,249,000
<b>Aboriginal Relations</b>	
Expense	\$204,588,000
Capital Investment	\$117,000
Financial Transactions	\$77,071,000
<b>Advanced Education</b>	
Expense	\$2,567,294,000
Capital Investment	\$217,340,000
Financial Transactions	\$579,000,000
<b>Agriculture and Forestry</b>	
Expense	\$1,128,189,000
Capital Investment	\$21,666,000
Financial Transactions	\$1,860,000
<b>Culture and Tourism</b>	
Expense	\$301,645,000
Capital Investment	\$2,342,000
Financial Transactions	\$1,618,000
<b>Economic Development and Trade</b>	
Expense	\$278,767,000
Capital Investment	\$25,000
<b>Education</b>	
Expense	\$4,314,825,000
Capital Investment	\$1,240,116,000
Financial Transactions	\$12,987,000
<b>Energy</b>	
Expense	\$371,399,000
Capital Investment	\$5,999,000
Financial Transactions	\$86,156,000
<b>Environment and Parks</b>	
Expense	\$510,277,000
Capital Investment	\$117,394,000
Financial Transactions	\$100,000

**Executive Council**

Expense	\$25,013,000
---------	--------------

**Health**

Expense	\$18,602,000,000
Capital Investment	\$64,587,000
Financial Transactions	\$64,400,000

**Human Services**

Expense	\$4,297,145,000
Capital Investment	\$6,801,000
Financial Transactions	\$680,000

**Infrastructure**

Expense	\$546,631,000
Capital Investment	\$1,023,730,000
Financial Transactions	\$49,162,000

**Jobs, Skills, Training and Labour**

Expense	\$206,666,000
Capital Investment	\$1,200,000

**Justice and Solicitor General**

Expense	\$1,282,888,000
Capital Investment	\$70,109,000

**Municipal Affairs**

Expense	\$1,398,365,000
Capital Investment	\$4,630,000
Financial Transactions	\$452,026,000

**Seniors**

Expense	\$575,271,000
Financial Transactions	\$9,500,000

**Service Alberta**

Expense	\$315,746,000
Capital Investment	\$45,921,000
Financial Transactions	\$15,000,000

**Status of Women**

Expense	\$1,447,000
---------	-------------

## **Transportation**

Expense	\$850,535,000
Capital Investment	\$1,616,411,000
Financial Transactions	\$78,124,000

## **Treasury Board and Finance**

Expense	\$150,816,000
Capital Investment	\$2,725,000
Financial Transactions	\$10,702,000
Transfer from the Lottery Fund	\$1,547,716,000

Mr. Malkinson then tabled copies of all amendments considered by Committee of Supply on this date for the official records of the Assembly.

The question being put, the report and the request for leave to sit again were agreed to.

## **Introduction of Bills (First Reading)**

Upon recommendation of Her Honour the Honourable the Lieutenant Governor, and notice having been given:

Bill 9 Appropriation Act, 2015 (\$) — Hon. Mr. Ceci

Hon. Mr. Mason, Government House Leader, requested and received the unanimous consent of the Assembly to waive Standing Orders 64(2) and 77(1) with regard to Bill 9, Appropriation Act, 2015, in order to allow the Bill to advance more than one stage in a day.

## **Government Bills and Orders**

### **Second Reading**

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 9 Appropriation Act, 2015 (\$) — Hon. Mr. Ceci

A debate followed.

During consideration of Bill 9, Mr. Cooper, Hon. Member for Olds-Didsbury-Three Hills, requested and received the unanimous consent of the Assembly to shorten the interval between division bells to one minute.

The question being put, the motion was agreed to. With Ms Jabbour in the Chair, the names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 40

Anderson (Leduc-Beaumont)	Hinkley	Nielsen
Bilous	Horne	Payne
Carson	Kazim	Piquette
Ceci	Kleinsteuber	Renaud
Connolly	Littlewood	Rosendahl
Coolahan	Loyola	Schmidt
Dach	Luff	Shepherd
Dang	Malkinson	Sigurdson
Drever	Mason	Sucha
Feehan	McKitrick	Sweet
Fitzpatrick	McLean	Turner
Ganley	McPherson	Westhead
Goehring	Miranda	Woollard
Gray		

Against the motion: 21

Anderson (Highwood)	Hunter	Smith
Cooper	Jansen	Starke
Cyr	Loewen	Stier
Drysdale	MacIntyre	Swann
Fildebrandt	McIver	Taylor
Gotfried	Panda	van Dijken
Hanson	Schneider	Yao

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 7 Alberta Human Rights Amendment Act, 2015 — Hon. Ms Ganley

Hon. Ms Ganley moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 5 Public Sector Compensation Transparency Act — Hon. Ms Ganley

Hon. Ms Ganley moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 6 Enhanced Protection for Farm and Ranch Workers Act — Hon. Ms Sigurdson

Hon. Ms Sigurdson moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

The following Bill was read a Second time and referred to Committee of the Whole:

Bill 9 Appropriation Act, 2015 (\$) — Hon. Mr. Ceci

### **Adjournment**

On motion by Hon. Mr. Mason, Government House Leader, that it be called 6:00 p.m., the Assembly adjourned at 5:50 p.m. until Thursday, November 26, 2015, at 9:00 a.m.

---

---

Hon. Robert E. Wanner,  
Speaker